

Original

# Effectiveness of Directly Observed Treatment, Short Course (DOTs) Centers in the control of Tuberculosis in Niger State, Nigeria <sup>1</sup>Adamu SU, <sup>2</sup>Ojetokun MB, <sup>3</sup>Adamu MB

<sup>1</sup>Department of Public Health, Faculty of Health Sciences, National Open University of Nigeria, Cadastral Zone Jabi, Abuja, Nigeria. <sup>2</sup>Department of Obstetrics and Gynecology, Ibrahim Badamasi Babangida Specialist Hospital, Minna, Niger state, Nigeria. <sup>3</sup>Department of Medical Microbiology, Faculty of Basic Medical, College of Medical Sciences, Abubakar Tafawa Balewa University, Bauchi State, Nigeria

**Corresponding author: Adamu Maryam Bappah,** Department of Medical Microbiology, Faculty of Basic Medical, College of Medical Sciences, Abubakar Tafawa Balewa University, PMB 0248, Bauchi State, Nigeria; maryambappah045@gmail.com; +2348068621763

Article history: Received 4 April 2024, Reviewed 31 May 2024, Accepted for publication 13 June 2024

#### Abstract

**Background:** Tuberculosis is still one of the major diseases of global health importance. It causes high mortality and morbidity worldwide. A lot of strategies to contain the infection of TB have been initiated among which are Directly Observed Treatment, and Short Courses (DOTs). The study aims to investigate the effectiveness of DOTs centers in the control of Tuberculosis in Niger State, Nigeria

**Method:** In this cross-sectional descriptive study, a multistage sampling technique was used to select participating healthcare facilities of Niger state with DOTs centers. A set of structured pretested questionnaires was used to obtain relevant information on diagnosis distribution, treatment outcome, characteristics of DOTs centers, challenges faced by DOTs centers, and the impact of COVID-19 on the study participants.

**Result:** A total of 1633 TB patients were enrolled. 37.2% (608) were female and 62.8% (1025) male. 26 DOTs centers were assessed, out of which 11 were primary, 13 were secondary, and 2 were tertiary health facilities respectively. Based on the result of this study, only 42.3% of DOTS centers met the WHO treatment success target, but the overall treatment success rate was 76.0% and the cure rate was 78.3% which is still below the WHO target of 85%.

**Conclusion:** There is a need to initiate some strategies that will lead to improvements in the control of tuberculosis in Niger State.

Keywords: Assessment Patients, Surveillance, Tuberculosis, treatment

# 

This is an open access journal and articles are distributed under the terms of the Creative Commons Attribution License (Attribution, Non-Commercial, ShareAlike'' 4.0) -(*CC* BY-NC-SA 4.0) that allows others to share the work with an acknowledgement of the work's authorship and initial publication in this journal.

#### How to cite this article:

Adamu SU, Ojetokun MB, Adamu MB. Effectiveness of Directly Observed Treatment, Short Course (DOTs) Centers in the control of Tuberculosis in Niger State, Nigeria. The Nigerian Health Journal 2024; 24(2): 1255 – 1265. https://doi.org/10.60787/tnbj.v24i2.808





# Introduction

Tuberculosis (TB) is an infectious Communicable disease caused by a bacterium called Mycobacterium tuberculosis with droplet inhalation as the route of transmission. It is known to be common among developing nations like Nigeria.<sup>21</sup> It is one of the top 10 killer infectious diseases in the world and it has become a pandemic.11 TB is a highly contagious infectious disease that has a significant impact on public health. According to WHO, 10.4 million people suffered from TB and 1.8 million died in 2015. Over 95% of TB deaths occur in low- and middle-income countries and South-East Asia contributes about 60% of the total TB burden in the world.26 Since the Emergence of this disease has been found to affect the host immune system, many strategies have been put in place to curb the spread of this debilitating infection. The control of tuberculosis continues to be topical as the burden and complexity of the disease are still a source of much concern both globally and locally. In more recent years, it has become even more complex due to a rise in its drug-resistant strains, amidst a range of other issues including human immunodeficiency virus (HIV) co-infection and TB (tuberculosis) comorbidities - diabetes, congestive heart failure, asbestosis, sarcoidosis, etc.39 The World Health Organization (WHO) estimates that Nigeria has one of the highest TB burdens in the world, accounting for 9% of all tuberculosis cases globally.<sup>22</sup> The disease cuts across all spheres, with the largest number of new TB rates by country happening in Southeast Asian and African countries. In 2020, for example, eight countries accounted for Two-thirds of new TB infections comprising 474,000 patients with multidrug resistant TB (MDR-TB) in all.28 Nigeria ranks second in TB prevalence in Africa with India ranking first and 7th of the top 8 Countries with the Highest Number of New TB Infections. Statistics show nearly 407,000 people are infected with TB every year. The situation is worsened by the HIV/AIDS epidemic and a high number of drug-resistant TB infections.<sup>27</sup> The outbreak of COVID-19 has significantly impacted the effectiveness of tuberculosis control programs, such as the Directly Observed Treatment, Short-course (DOTs) Center, in Nigeria.<sup>38</sup> According to a study by Ogbudebe et al., the pandemic has considerably affected the delivery of tuberculosis services, including diagnosis, treatment, and follow-up.40

Directly Observed Treatment, Short Course (DOTs) is a proven strategy for the control of TB, which involves direct observation of patients taking their medication by trained healthcare professionals. The effectiveness of the DOTs Centers is particularly important in preventing the emergence of drug-resistant TB strains, which pose a significant challenge to the control of TB.<sup>24</sup> Furthermore, the efficient delivery of DOTs services has the potential to reduce the duration of TB treatment, improve patient

The Nigerian Health Journal, Volume 24, Issue 2 Published by The Nigerian Medical Association, Rivers State Branch. Downloaded from www.tnhjph.com Print ISSN: 0189-9287 Online ISSN: 2992-345X outcomes, and reduce the recurrence of TB cases. Niger State is still battling to meet the WHO cure rate standard in the control of TB. Niger is a state in the North Central region of Nigeria and the largest state in the country. Niger State has three political zones, zone A, B and C. The state's capital is at Minna. Other major cities are Bida, Kontagora, and Suleja.

The Directly Observed Treatment, Short Course (DOTs) strategy has been implemented in Minna, Niger state to control the spread of the disease. However, there is a need to assess the effectiveness of DOTs center in Minna in achieving treatment success and reducing morbidity and mortality rates from TB. Also, over the past decades, many studies have evaluated the DOTs program and its effectiveness worldwide where TB health workers were involved however there is a paucity of research done to evaluate the effectiveness of DOTs centers in Nigeria, especially Niger State. In view of these, there is a need to evaluate the effectiveness of the DOTs center in controlling TB in Minna, Niger state, and identify potential areas for improvement in the implementation of the DOTs strategy.

Despite being recommended by the WHO<sup>26</sup> as the preferred approach to treating TB, the effectiveness of the strategy in the control of the disease in Niger State is not well established. Also, considering the high prevalence of drug-resistant tuberculosis in Nigeria, The effectiveness of the DOTs Centers is particularly important in preventing the emergence of drug-resistant TB strains, which pose a significant challenge to the control of TB. Therefore, this research topic aims to investigate the effectiveness of DOTs centers in the control of TB in Niger State, Nigeria.

# Method

# Study Area

This study was conducted in health facilities offering DOTs services of each Zone within Niger state. Niger State is located in North central part of Nigeria between Longitude 10°00'N and latitude 6°00'E. It has a total of 26 Local Government Areas.

# Study Population

This study was conducted among Lab Technician, Pharmacist, and DOTS officers who are involved in the delivery of health services in the health facilities in Niger state

# Inclusion Criteria and Exclusion Criteria

Only those health facilities in each local government with higher TB patients turn out that offer DOTs in Niger state were included and those centers unwilling to participate were excluded from the study.



# Study Design and Sampling Technique

This was a descriptive cross-sectional study. The researcher adopted the Multistage Sampling technique.<sup>36, 37</sup> in the first stage; simple random sampling was used to select health care facilities in Niger State offering DOTs services. The second stage involves the selection of Local Government (LGA), at this level, the list of all the health care facilities in Niger state offering DOTs was stratified into LGA offering DOTs. In the third stage, Twenty-six facilities with the highest TB patient load from all the 26 LGA of Niger state were selected for the study using systematic random sampling.

#### Instrument of Data Collection

A set of structured pretested questionnaires was used to obtain relevant information from Lab Technicians, pharmacists, and DOTS officers. The questionnaire had four sections as follows: Section A: Diagnosis distribution and treatment outcome, Section B: Characteristics of DOTs center, Section C: DOTs centers Assessment variables and Challenges faced by DOTs centers, and Section D: Measures to ensure compliance and drug supply to patients during COVID-19 lockdown. The questionnaire was developed based on the objectives and scope of the study which were clearly defined, in other to draw relevant questions. The questions were later revised, reviewed for clarity, and organized into sections. The questionnaire was pretested among health workers in DOTs centers that weren't selected for the main research work. Necessary amendments were made thereafter.

#### Method of Data Collection

An account was created on https://kobo.humanitarianresponse.info to have access to the server. This questionnaire was then inputted onto the server after which it was deployed. The deployed questionnaire was then accessed by downloading an app called ODK (open data kit) which was used in the collection of the data. The data collected was sent to the server from where it was downloaded for analysis.

# Data Analysis

The categorical variables were analyzed and presented as frequencies and percentages while quantitative variables were analyzed and presented as summary measures in the form of measures of central tendency and their corresponding measures of dispersion e.g. mean and standard deviation depending on whether the data is normally distributed or not. The chi-square test was used to determine the relationship between some factors responsible for the effectiveness of DOTs center and the overall standard success Variables. P-values less than 0.05 were considered statistically significant at 0.05 or 95% Confidence level.

The Nigerian Health Journal, Volume 24, Issue 2 Published by The Nigerian Medical Association, Rivers State Branch. Downloaded from www.tnhjph.com Print ISSN: 0189-9287 Online ISSN: 2992-345X

### Ethical Consideration

Ethical clearance was obtained from the Department of Public Health, National Open University of Nigeria with the reference number (ETC/22/04/Noun214075940). Approval to conduct the study was also, obtained from the Ministry of Health Niger State, Nigeria. Before participation, all participants were informed about the aims and objectives of the study, their freedom of participation, and the anonymity of their participation. Only those centers that gave informed consent to partake in the study were recruited. The data obtained was handled with the utmost confidentiality.

# Results

A total of 26 DOTs centers were assessed, out of which 11 were primary, 13 secondary, and 2 tertiary health facilities respectively. A total of 1633 TB patients undergoing treatment were enrolled in the study among which about 37.2% (608) were female and 62.8% (1025) male.

Table 1: DOTs facility profile and profile of enrolees

Variable	Freq (N)	Percent (%)
Primary	11	42.3
Secondary	13	50.0
Tertiary	2	7.7
Total Number of Enrolee	1633	100
Male	1025	62.8
Female	608	37.2

Table 2 showed that only about 57% (922) of the enrollees tested positive for Laboratory tests. Thirty-two percent (32%) of the study participants completed treatment. Among those who tested positive only 44 (2.7%) died in the course of treatment or after completing treatment, Forty-four (44%) percent of the TB treatment enrollees were completely cured. The Overall cure rate per facility is 78.3% and the overall treatment success rate per facility is 76%.

 Table 2: Diagnosis distribution and treatment outcome

Variables	Frequency Percentages	
	(N)	(%)
Total Number of patient who	922	56.5
tested Positive to laboratory Test		
AFB/GeneXpert		
GeneXpert Alone	837	51.3
Number of patients who	519	31.8
Complete treatment		
Total number of deaths	44	2.7
Number of Patient with TB/HIV	162	9.9
co-infection		
Number of Patient who are cured	722	44.2
Cure rate	78.3%	
Treatment success rate	76.0%	



Table 3 showed that the majority of the DOTs centers 16 (61.50%) have a good overall Quality of training. In addition to this, a little above half of the centers 14(53.80) has efficient Surveillance in Niger despite the challenges noted in the state. The table also, revealed that more than two-thirds of the DOTs centers had problems with adequate capacity building, staff attrition, and lack of motivation and office equipment. It was noted from the tables that overall, only 15 (57.7%) of the DOTs centers evaluated had a good treatment success rate (treatment success rate of 85% and above) whereas 11 (42.3) had a poor treatment success rate. The table showed 21(80.80%) of DOTs facilities agreed that COVID-19 locked down affects the effectiveness of service delivery and 22 (84.6%) also agreed that COVID-19 prevents TB patient from accessing their treatment in the DOTs center, however, the Majority of the centers 25(96.2%) didn't record mortality during the locked down

Table	3:	DOTs	centers	Assessment	variables	and
Challer	iges	s faced b	by DOT	s centers		

Variables	No. of	Percent
	Centers	(%)
Overall Quality of		
Training (QOT)		
Poor QOT	10	38.50
Good QOT	16	61.50
Overall treatment success		
rate		
Good treatment rate	15	57.70
Poor treatment rate	11	42.30
Overall surveillance		
Efficient	14	53.80
In-efficient	12	46.20
Challenges faced by DOTs centers Inadequate office space Need capacity building Staff attrition Lack motivation Inadequate office equipment Unavailability of drugs Reagent shortage	3 17 17 19 12 9 1	12.00 64.08 64.08 72.00 46.00 34.00 4.00
Impact of COVID 19 on effectiveness of DOTs centre COVID-19 affects service delivery?		
Yes	21	80.80
No	5	19.20
COVID-19 Affect Patient		
outpour		
Yes	22	84.50

84.6 15.4 his cente 73.1 26.9	nt e in this r?
of DOTs Percen gs 23.1 3.8 50.0 23.1 ocol use 84.6 15.4 his cente 73.1 26.9 on TB 50.0	4.00 96.00 centers tt e in this
of DOTs Percen gs 23.1 3.8 50.0 23.1 ocol use 84.6 15.4 his cente 73.1 26.9 on TB 50.0	96.00 centers at e in this
of DOTs Percen gs 23.1 3.8 50.0 23.1 ocol use 84.6 15.4 his cente 73.1 26.9 on TB 50.0	96.00 centers at e in this
of DOTs Percen gs 23.1 3.8 50.0 23.1 ocol use 84.6 15.4 his cente 73.1 26.9 on TB 50.0	96.00 centers at e in this
of DOTs Percent gs 23.1 3.8 50.0 23.1 ocol use 84.6 15.4 his cente 73.1 26.9 on TB 50.0	centers at e in this r?
Percent gs 23.1 3.8 50.0 23.1 ocol use 84.6 15.4 his cente 73.1 26.9 on TB 50.0	nt e in this r?
Percent gs 23.1 3.8 50.0 23.1 ocol use 84.6 15.4 his cente 73.1 26.9 on TB 50.0	nt e in this r?
gs 23.1 3.8 50.0 23.1 ocol use 84.6 15.4 his center 73.1 26.9 on TB 50.0	e in this r?
23.1 3.8 50.0 23.1 ocol use 84.6 15.4 his cente 73.1 26.9 on TB 50.0	e in this r? 8 service
50.0 23.1 ocol use 84.6 15.4 his cente 73.1 26.9 on TE 50.0	r?
23.1 ocol use 84.6 15.4 his cente 73.1 26.9 on TB 50.0	r?
ocol use 84.6 15.4 his cente 73.1 26.9 on TB 50.0	r?
84.6 15.4 his cente 73.1 26.9 on TB 50.0	r?
15.4 his cente 73.1 26.9 on TB 50.0	
15.4 his cente 73.1 26.9 on TB 50.0	
his cente 73.1 26.9 on TB 50.0	
73.1 26.9 <b>on TB</b> 50.0	
26.9 on TB 50.0	service
<b>on TB</b> 50.0	service
50.0	service
V co infe	ction?
46.2	
53.8	
outreach	es?
15.4	
84.6	
7.7	
92.3	
tivities	
76.9	
23.1	
and eval	uation of
65.4	
34.6	
	<b>,</b>
-	
-	
	istances?
-	
	g cases?
	rator for
	15.4 84.6 7.7 92.3 <b>tivities</b> 76.9 23.1 <b>and eval</b> 65.4



Yes	16	61.5	
No	10	38.5	
110	10	50.5	

This table shows variables answering the facility-based characteristics which includes the Center monitoring, quality training, laboratory characteristic and pharmaco-vigilance.



**Figure 1:** Measures to ensure compliance and drug supply to patients during lock down

Despite the affectation of service delivery during COVID-19, efforts were still made to ensure the compliance of medication to TB. Among the measures put in place by the service provider at the DOTs center was to deliver the drug to TB patients at home during the period of COVID-19 lockdown.

Table 5: Association between Quality of training, Supervision, pharmacovigilance and some selected DOTS Centre
characteristic and the Treatment success rate of WHO standard.

Variables	Treatment success rate		Test	
	Poor (<85%)	Good (≥85)	— Statistics	
Total Number of trained staff per year			χ=0.200	
0	6 (60.0%)	4 (40.0%)	p=0.905	
1	7 (53.8)	6 (46.2%)	1	
2	2 (66.7)	1 (33.3%)		
Regularity of holding meeting		$\chi = 3.887$		
None	5 (83.3%)	1 (16.7%)	p=0.274	
Weekly	0	1(100%)	1	
Monthly	6 (46.2%)	7 (53.8%)		
Two Months and above	4 (66.7%)	2 (33.3%)		
Regular monitoring and evaluation of activities in this centre			Fisher's Exact	
Yes	10(47.6%)	11 (52.4%)	Test	
No	5 (100%)	0	p=0.046	
Workers use standard operation protocol in the this centre		Fisher's Exact		
Yes	12 (54.5%)	10 (45.5%)	Test	
No	3 (75%)	1(25%)	P=0.614	
Have DOT Centre work plan			Fisher's Exact	
Yes	10 (52.6%)	9 (47.4%)	Test	
No	5 (71.4%)	2 (28.6%)	P=0.658	
Shortage of Reagent	× /		Fisher's Exact	
Yes	0	1 (100)	Test	
No	15 (60.0%)	10 (40.0)	p=0.423	



The Nigerian Health Journal; Volume 24, Issue 2 – June, 2024 Effectiveness of Directly Observed Treatment (DOTs) in the control of Tuberculosis, Adamu SU et al

Availability of Functional refrigerator for	or Keeping Reagent		Fisher's Exact
Yes	7 (43.8%)	9 (56.3%)	Test
No	8 (80.0%)	2 (20.0%)	p = 0.109
Shortage of Drug		, ,	Fisher's Exact
Yes	3 (100.0%)	0	Test
No	12(52.20%)	13 (47.80%)	P=0.238
Where do you store your drugs?			Fisher's Exact
Others	5 (100)	0	P=0.046
Shelves	10 (47.6%)	11 (52.4%)	
Surveillance			Fisher's Exact
Inefficient	8 (66.7)	4 (33.3%)	Test
Efficient	7 (50.0%)	7 (50.0%)	P=0.453
Quality of training (QOT)			Fisher's Exact
Poor QOT	6 (60.0%)	4 (40.0%)	Test
Good QOT	9 (56.3%)	7 (43.8%)	P=1.000

Table 5 revealed that there is statistical significant association between Regular monitoring and evaluation of activities in this centre; and the mode of drug storage and Treatment success rate (p<0.05). Other variables show no significant association with treatment success rate. (p<0.05= significant difference and p>0.05= non-significant difference.



The Nigerian Health Journal; Volume 24, Issue 2 – June, 2024 Effectiveness of Directly Observed Treatment (DOTs) in the control of Tuberculosis, Adamu MB et al

#### Discussion

Directly Observe Treatment Short course adopted by WHO in Nigeria entails political will and commitment at all levels for the provision of free TB services to all Nigerians through prompt laboratory diagnosis of TB and ensuring consistent and strict drug uptake by patients according to the studied guidelines. This study is one of the few research endeavors to evaluate the effectiveness of DOTs centers in the control of Tuberculosis in Niger State. This study showed that thousand six hundred and thirty-three patients diagnosed with TB were managed in the selected DOTs Centers across the 26 LGA of Niger state. Half of these facilities were secondary and others were primary and tertiary. The sex distribution of the study population showed a higher prevalence of the disease in males with a ratio of 1.7 to 1 which is in keeping with the global ratio of 1.2 to 1 which in turn is similar to the findings from previous studies by<sup>2</sup>1in Minna,<sup>13</sup> in 3 DOTs Centers in Anambra,17 in Ogbomoso,19 in Eku hospital, and<sup>36</sup> in Delta. Males are known to have an increased risk of contracting TB due to several risk factors, occupational hazards, carefree attitudes, and some other lifestyle choices that can compromise immunity. Males are also known to have poorer health-seeking behavior than females hence usually seek medical attention late at advanced stages of the disease. In addition, males are known to have poor adherence to treatment and often default to treatment compared to females.<sup>10&32</sup>

The effectiveness of DOTs centers in the control of tuberculosis depends on the quality of training, effective surveillance, and treatment success rate. In this study, slightly below half of the study participants achieved a cure rate (Table 2). In terms of treatment outcome, it's no longer news that Tuberculosis is still a major public health concern in Nigeria and the world at large as it causes a lot of morbidity and mortality. Despite the availability of treatment and easy access to treatment, the treatment outcome of TB is still below the WHO treatment success target. In this study, the overall treatment success rate which is a combination of treatment completed and cured was found to be below the 85% WHO recommended target. A study from north northwestern part of Nigeria recorded a treatment success rate of 80.2% which is slightly above the result of this study.33 The findings from this study are also noticed to have a lower treatment success rate when compared with results of<sup>17</sup> in Ogbomoso (2008 to 2012) reported a success rate of 85.5% and13 in 3 DOTs centers in Anambra with a success rate of 86.4%,31 in Eastern Ethiopia,<sup>35</sup> in Ethiopia and<sup>34</sup> in Egypt (2019). However, some studies revealed results that are below this study's finding like research conducted in Eku, Nigeria<sup>19</sup> (2009 to 2013) with a success rate of 58.6%, another one.<sup>7,9</sup> With regards to the proportion of patients that died, findings from this study recorded 2.7%, which is similar to what was seen in recent studies in Nigeria and Ethiopia<sup>19, 7, 34, 20, & 29</sup> but lesser than what was observed in a few other studies<sup>17,4</sup> This could be due to loss of a patient to follow up and detached to the treatment plan.

In this study, we also looked into the quality of training which encompasses the regularity of holding meetings, use of standard operation protocol and center work plan, special training on TB service provision, and training on TB/HIV co-infection for health workers in charge of DOTs. Greater than half of the DOTs centers have good quality training which simply implies that the majority of the centers had at least a trained staff, used standard operating procedure (SOP), and have good knowledge of HIV/TB co-infection (Table 4). Organizing trainings or workshops for TB health workers are often included in the national TB control strategy to increase effective TB surveillance, Prompt TB case detection, and hence improve treatment success rate. Well, this may be because there are some factors like inadequate medical supplies, enhanced health care infrastructure, and effective laboratory and staff attrition which all contribute to the success of TB treatment in DOTs centers. It is also worthy of note to mention that there is no any significant association between effective surveillance, quality of training and treatment success rate (Table 5).

In terms of surveillance (Table 3), only a little above half of the centers evaluated have good surveillance practices. Proper health surveillance plays a critical role in the treatment success and control of TB. Early case detection, timely diagnosis, prompt treatment initiation, treatment adherence support, and effective monitoring and evaluation are key elements facilitated by health surveillance systems. These factors contribute to improved treatment success rates and overall TB control By strengthening health efforts. surveillance, policymakers and healthcare providers can enhance TB control strategies and achieve better treatment outcomes.

A study by Odone et al.<sup>14</sup> demonstrated that active casefinding strategies, such as contact tracing and systematic screening, significantly contributed to the early



identification of TB cases, leading to improved treatment success rates. A study by Tassema et al.<sup>23</sup> and Awunor et al,<sup>33</sup> found that a comprehensive surveillance system integrated with rapid molecular diagnostic tools significantly reduced the time to diagnosis and improved treatment success rates. A study by Alene et al.<sup>3</sup> reported that active surveillance interventions, including patient-centered support, significantly improved treatment success rates. It was also noted by Biadglegne et al.<sup>6</sup> in a study where its findings showed robust surveillance systems are essential for continuous program improvement and achieving optimal treatment success rates. The aforementioned statements are all in agreement with the findings of this research.

Regarding the proportion of facilities that meet the WHO target treatment success rate (Table 3), slightly below half of the centers meet requirements, this is worrisome, however, It's not surprising as some centers are not functional due to many reasons among which insecurity top the list, this invariably makes those DOTs center inaccessible to the patient as everyone is afraid of losing their life. Inadequate capacity building, office equipment, lack of staff motivation, and staff attrition are among other factors that affect the effectiveness of DOTs centers in the control of TB.

In addition, this study also evaluates the challenges faced by DOTs centers in Minna (Table 3). This study revealed that more than two-thirds of the DOTs centers reported inadequate capacity building, staff attrition, and lack of staff motivation, barely under half of centers also reported inadequate office equipment. Thirty-two percent of the centers reported unavailability of TB Drugs whereas only 12% of the center had a shortage of reagents. This is in consistence with the findings of Abdulraheem et al.1 which report that inadequate training and low staff morale significantly affected the performance of healthcare workers in TB control programs in Nigeria thereby reducing the effectiveness of DOTs centers. Also, Ukwaja et al.25 stated that the absence of proper record-keeping systems and limited access to electronic databases negatively impacted the monitoring and evaluation of TB control programs in Nigeria. Ekeke et al.8 reported that stock-outs of anti-TB drugs were a common occurrence in Nigeria, leading to treatment delays and poor treatment outcomes. Shortage of reagents was also noticed by Odumeet al.15 who reported the scarcity of reagents in Nigeria's laboratory will lead to a backlog in TB testing, delayed treatment initiation, and invariably affect the treatment success rate of TB. Adamu and McGill,5 also identified a general problem associated with the Laboratories of the DOTs center covered by their study to include shortage of reagents/materials epileptic or erratic supply of electricity. Despite having stand-by generators in most of the centers, fueling the generators is a major bottleneck.

These challenges can lead to sub-optimal case management, delayed treatment initiation, poor treatment adherence, inefficient data management, and delayed diagnosis, ultimately hampering the effectiveness of TB control efforts.

On the effect of COVID-19 on the effectiveness of DOTs centers, COVID-19 has also been found to have a direct and indirect effect on the effectiveness of DOTs centers in the control of TB (Table 3). The COVID-19 pandemic affects the world healthcare system by leading to the closure of many health facilities and in turn stopping routine screening and treatment. The implementation of infection prevention and control measures for COVID-19, such as physical distancing, quarantine, and lockdowns have impacted the delivery of TB services.<sup>31</sup>

This study showed that over 80% of the DOTs centers revealed that COVID-19 locked down affects service delivery, this is similar to the findings of a study by Oleribe et al.<sup>18</sup> who reported challenges in the procurement and distribution of TB medications during the COVID-19 pandemic. This study also noted that over 90% of the DOTs centers recorded a low outpour of patients during COVID-19 lockdown; however, 96.2% of the centers didn't lose a single patient to COVID-19 during this period. This result is consistent with the findings of Agboghoroma et al.<sup>2</sup> and Oladimeji et al.<sup>16</sup> which show that during the COVID-19 pandemic, there was a reduction in the number of TB cases diagnosed, treatment interruptions, and decreased treatment success rates.

The low outpour of the patients was in consistent with the findings of Sanni et al.<sup>22</sup> which stated that fear of exposure to COVID-19 and concerns about the safety of healthcare facilities contributed to a decline in TB case detection rates in Nigeria during the pandemic, which may have affected treatment success outcomes.

On measures to ensure compliance and drug supply during the COVID-19 lockdown, this study found that 65.40% deliver drugs to TB patients at home (Figure 1). This is to mitigate the negative effects of COVID-19 on TB treatment success as the COVID-19 outbreak's frightening rate of disease spread throughout Nigeria and the world, nearly every sector has been put to the test.<sup>38</sup> The Nigerian government and healthcare authorities have implemented various strategies to



provide uninterrupted service delivery to TB patients which include; the integration of TB and COVID-19 services to ensure continuity of care, the provision of telemedicine and virtual consultations, and the strengthening of infection prevention and control measures in healthcare facilities.<sup>2</sup> Proper storage conditions, good hygiene, and distribution practices should always be adhered to at both DOTs Centers, Pharmacies, and Medical stores.<sup>12</sup> Additionally, public health campaigns and community engagement efforts have been launched to address misconceptions and fears surrounding TB and COVID-19, aiming to encourage TB patients to seek timely medical care.<sup>22</sup> Also, the conduction of follow-up service is statistically significantly associated with treatment success rate (Table 5).

#### Implication of the study

This study has identified influencing DOTs effectiveness as such by utilizing strategies to optimize DOTs implementation, it can lead to enhanced tuberculosis control, improved treatment outcomes, reduced treatment failure, decreased drug resistance, and reduction of morbidity and mortality. The study's results can guide policy decisions, ensuring that tuberculosis control programs are data-driven and effective. The study can strengthen research capacity in Niger state, fostering a culture of evidence-based decision-making in healthcare and ultimately contributing to the achievement of international targets in tuberculosis control.

#### Strengths and Limitations of the Study

Studying the effectiveness of DOTs centers in Niger State can provide valuable insights into the effectiveness of tuberculosis control measures. Research has identified areas for improvement in the delivery of tuberculosis services, thus, enabling targeted interventions. Efficient use of resources can be promoted, reducing waste and maximizing the impact of investments in tuberculosis control.

Conducting research in resource-poor settings like Niger State has been a challenge due to limited infrastructure, funding, and personnel. Tuberculosis-related stigma and cultural beliefs as well as ensuring informed consent, confidentiality, and participant privacy made it very difficult for data collection and study participation.

#### Declarations

*Informed consent:* All participants were informed about the aims and objectives of the study, their freedom of participation and the anonymity of their participation. Only those centers that gave informed consent to

partake in the study were recruited. The data obtained was handled with the utmost confidentiality.

*Authors' Contribution:* Adamu SU researched literature and conceived the study; Adamu MB reviewed and edited the manuscript; Ojetokun MB was involved in protocol development, gaining ethical approval, patient recruitment, and data analysis. All authors contributed to the final version of the manuscript

**Conflict of interest:** The authors declare that there is no conflict of interest, and that the manuscript has not been published so far or communicated to some other journals.

*Funding:* This research did not receive any specific grant from funding agencies in the public, commercial, or not-for-profit sectors.

**Acknowledgment:** The Authors want to deeply appreciate the support, guidance, and valuable feedback from the supervisors of this research work. Sincere gratitude goes to the lecturers and staff of the Department of Public Health, National Open University of Nigeria, for their assistance and contribution to creating a conducive learning environment. The Authors are deeply grateful to all the staff of DOTs centers involved in this study for their cooperation towards the successful conduct of this research, special appreciation to the staff of Niger State Ministry of Health for their assistance was vital in the success of the research work.

#### References

- Abdulraheem IS, Bara'atu H, Mairiga AG. Assessment of tuberculosis control program performance in primary health care facilities in Kwara State, Nigeria. J Public Health Afr. 2019;10 (2):904. doi:10.4081/jphia.2019.904
- Agboghoroma CO, Ukwaja KN, Lawson L. The impact of the COVID-19 pandemic on tuberculosis control in Nigeria. Int J Tuberc Lung Dis. 2021;25 (5):411-415. doi:10.5588/ijtld.20.0554
- Alene KA, Clements AC, McBryde ES, Jaramillo E, Lönnroth K, Shaweno D. Sequelae of multidrug-resistant tuberculosis: protocol for a systematic review and meta-analysis. BMJ Open. 2020:10 (8):e036562. doi:10.1136/bmjopen-2019-036562
- Alobu I, Oshi SN, Oshi DC, Ukwaja KN. Risk factors of treatment default and death among tuberculosis patients in a resource-limited setting. Asian Pac J Trop Med. 201<u>4</u>;7 (12):977-984. doi:10.1016/S1995-7645(14)60172- <u>3</u>
- Adamu SU & McGill D. Drugs Supply and Laboratory Services in DOTs System of Kaduna State: A Health Care Worker Perspective. J. Tuber Res, 2018 (6), 19-35. doi: <u>10.4236/jtr.2018.61003</u>.



- Biadglegne F, Tessema B, Sack U, Rodloff AC. Development of real-time PCR assays for the detection and quantification of Mycobacterium tuberculosis. Mol Cell Probes. 2021; 57:101691. doi:10.1016/j.mcp.2021.101691
- Ebuenyi I, Ikuabe P, Jumbo J. Treatment Outcome of Tuberculosis at One Year: A Single Centre's Experience in Niger Delta, Nigeria. Int J Trop Dis Heal. 2016;12 (1):1-6. doi:10.9734/ijtdh/2016/22079
- Ekeke N, Ukwaja K, Chukwu J, Nwafor C, Meka A, Odikamnoro O. Factors affecting treatment outcomes among tuberculosis patients in Lagos, Nigeria: A prospective cohort study. Infect Dis Poverty. 2020;9(1):7. doi:10.1186/s40249-020-0626-3
- Fiseha T, Gebru T, Gutema H, Debela Y. Trends of Tuberculosis and Treatment Outcomes at MizanAman General Hospital, Southwest Ethiopia: A Four Year Retrospective Study. J Bioeng Biomed Sci. 2015;5(1). doi:10.4172/2155
- Mitike G, Kebede D, Yeneneh H. HIV infection and antituberculosis drug resistance among pulmonary tuberculosis patients in Harar Tuberculosis Centre, Ethiopia. East Afr. Med. J. 1997 Mar 1;74(3):154-7.
- Gadhave NA, Lade KS, Singh MC, Sawant SD. Tuberculosis: A dreaded or curable disease –A Review. J Pharma Re 2011; 4:2107–19.
- Ibrahim B, Adamu SU, Nock IH, Aji AG. Microbiological quality of anti-tuberculosis drugs commonly used at DOTs centres and pharmacies within Kaduna Metropolis, Kaduna, Nigeria. Sci. World J. 2021 Aug 11;16 (2):162-71.
- Nwachukwu ON, Reginald AO, Victor ON, Anthony O. Treatment outcomes of new smear positive pulmonary tuberculosis patients under directly observed treatment in Anambra state, Nigeria. Pulm. Crit. Care Med. 2017;2(1):1-4. doi:10.15761/pccm.1000128
- Odone A, Calderon R, Becerra MC. Active case finding of tuberculosis in Europe: a Tuberculosis Network European Trials Group (TBNET) survey. Eur Respir J. 2019;54 (4):1801178. doi:10.1183/13993003.01178-2018
- Odume BB, Ani AE, Odunukwe N. Laboratory aspects of tuberculosis control in Nigeria: Lessons learned and recommendations for expansion of services. Niger J Clin Pract. 2020;23 (5):667-676. doi:10.4103/njcp.njcp\_250\_19.
- Oladimeji O, Michael AI, Lawson L, Impact of the COVID-19 pandemic on tuberculosis services in Nigeria. Public Health Action. 2021;11 (1):43-48. doi:10.5588/pha.21.0010

- Olarewaju S, Olanrewaju O, Folorunsho E, et al. Treatment outcome of tuberculosis patients registered at DOTs centre in a tertiary care hospital. Tuberc Res Treatmen. 2014. doi:10.1016/j.ijid.2014.03.953
- Oleribe OO, Oladimeji O, Mamadu I, et al. The COVID-19 pandemic and tuberculosis control: Implications for tuberculosis care in Nigeria. Int J Infect Dis. 2021; 102:7-10. doi:10.1016/j.ijid.2020.10.041
- Onorikpori TO. Prevalence and treatment outcome of pulmonary tuberculosis in Eku Hospital, Delta state. 2014
- Rahimi BA, Rahimy N, Mukaka M, Ahmadi MS, Wasiq AW. Determinants of treatment failure among tuberculosisnpatients in Kandahar City, Afghanistan: A 5 Year Retrospective Cohort Study. Int J Mycobacteriology. 2019; 8:359-365. doi:10.4103/ijmy.ijmy
- Sani RA, Garba SA, Oyeleke SB & Abalaka, M.E. Prevalence of Pulmonary Tuberculosis (PTB) in Minna and Suleja Niger State, Nigeria. Am. J. Med. Med. Sci. 2015; 5, 287-291.
- Sanni SA, Mavundza E, Chukwueme N, et al. The impact of COVID-19 on tuberculosis notification in Nigeria, January-December 2020. Pan Afr Med J. 2021; 38:44. doi: 10.11604/pamj.supp.2021.38.3.28080
- Tessema B, Biadglign S, Ejeta E, et al. Magnitude and determinants of treatment outcomes among tuberculosis patients in Ethiopia: a systematic review and meta-analysis. PLoS One. 2020; 15(5):e0232485. doi:10.1371/journal.pone.0232485
- Ukwaja KN, Alobu I, Ifebunandu NA, Osakwe CP. Trends in treatment outcome of smearpositive pulmonary tuberculosis in Southeastern Nigeria , 1999 - 2008. Ital J Public Health. 2012; 9(4): 1-7.
- Ukwaja KN, Modebe O, Igwenyi C, Alobu I. The Challenges and Prospects of Tuberculosis Control in Nigeria. Tuberc Res Treat. 2019;2019: 2854726. doi:10.1155/2019/285.
- World Health Organization (2019). Global tuberculosis report 2019. Retreievd from <u>https://www.who.int/tb/publications/global\_rep\_ort/en/</u>
- 27. WHO Tuberculosis fact sheet 2022 (https://www.who.int/news-room/factsheets/detail/tuberculosis)
- World Health Organization. 2021. Coronavirus disease (COVID-19) and tuberculosis. <u>https://www.afro.who.int/publications/coronavir</u> <u>us-disease-covid-19-and-tuberculosis-tb-</u> <u>frequently-asked-questions-faq</u>.



- Yakob B, Alemseged F, Paulos W, Badacho AS. Trends in Treatment Success Rate and Associated Factors among Tuberculosis Patients in Ethiopia: A Retrospective Cohort Study. Heal Sci J. 2018;12(5). doi:10.21767/1791- 809x.1000598
- Yimer SA, Bjune GA, Holm-Hansen C. Time to first consultation, diagnosis and treatment of TB among patients attending a referral hospital in Northwest, Ethiopia. BMC Infect Dis. 2019;19 (1):709. doi:10.1186/s12879-019-4370-9
- Zenebe T, Tefera E. Tuberculosis treatment outcome and associated factors among smearpositive pulmonary tuberculosis patients in Afar, Eastern Ethiopia: a retrospective study. Brazilian J Infect Dis. 2016;20 (6):635-636. doi:10.1016/j.bjid.20
- 32. Vijay SP, Kumar LS, Chauhan SV, Rao,& Vaidyanathan P., "Treatment outcome and mortality at one and half year follow-up of HIV infected TB patients under TB control programme in a district of South India," PLoS ONE, vol. 6, no. 7, Article ID e21008, 2011.
- Nyemike S A, Innocent OA, Alexander A, Treatment outcomes of tuberculosis patients in a Directly Observed Treatment Short course (DOTS) Referral Centre in Delta State, Nigeria: a five-year review (2012 - 2016)
- 34. El Emeirya F, Shalaby S, Abo El-Magda GH, Marwa M. Treatment outcomes of tuberculosis among new smear-positive and retreatment cases: a retrospective study in two Egyptian governorates. Eqyptian J Chest Dis Tuberc. 2019;68(1):74-79. doi:10.4103/ejcdt.ejcdt
- Asfaw T, Lewetegn M, Tariku H. Trends and Treatment Outcomes of Tuberculosis in DebreBerhan Referral Hospital, DebreDrehan, Ethiopia. Clin Med Res. 2018;7(5):97-102. doi:10.11648/j.cmr.20180705.11
- Adamu SU, Adamu MB, Mshelia YG, <u>Usage of</u> <u>complementary and alternative medicine among</u> <u>pregnant women attending prenatal care setting in</u> <u>Abuja, Nigeria</u> Scope 2023;13 (2), 330-33
- 37. Sedgwick P. Multistage sampling. BMJ. 2015;351.
- Saliu OA, Idowu OA, Adamu SU, Alaba OA. COVID-19 in Nigeria: lockdown measures and a chronological epidemiological review during the first wave. Texila International Journal of Public Health. 2022 May 12;10 (1):1-22.
- Eze GU, Aduh U, Obiebi IP, Obodo KT. Profile and Treatment Outcomes of Patients with Tuberculosis: A Five-year Review of Patients on DOTS in Delta State, Nigeria Journal of community medicine and primary health care, 2018vol. 30, NO 1,

 Ogbudebe, C. L., Okoli, F. C., Arinze-Onyia, S. U., Modebe, V. C., & Okafor, I. P. (2021). Disruptions in tuberculosis control due to COVID-19 pandemic in Nigeria. International Journal of Mycobacteriology, 10(1), 85–88.